



長春社 Since1968

The Conservancy Association

會址: 香港新界葵涌貨櫃碼頭路 77-81 號 Magnet Place 一期  
13 樓 1305-6 室

Address: Units 1305-6, 13/F, Tower 1, Magnet Place, 77-81 Container Port  
Road, Kwai Chung, New Territories, H.K.

網址 Website: www.cahk.org.hk

電話 Tel.: (852) 2728 6781 傳真 Fax.: (852) 2728 5538

電子郵件 E-mail: cahk@cahk.org.hk

30<sup>th</sup> August 2022

Town Planning Board  
15/F North Point Government Offices  
333 Java Road  
North Point  
Hong Kong

By e-mail: tpbpd@pland.gov.hk

Dear Sir/Madam,

Representations relating to the Draft Fanling/Sheung Shui Extension Area Outline  
Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/FSSE/1

The Conservancy Association is writing to submit our representations relating to the Draft Fanling/Sheung Shui Extension Area OZP No. S/FSSE/1.

**1. Mitigation and compensation due to direct loss of woodland/mixed  
woodland in the proposed Residential (Group A) zone (R(A) zone)**

Section 3.6.2.1 of “Technical Study on Partial Development of Fanling Golf Course Site – Feasibility Study – Planning Report for Preparation of OZP – Final Issue 1” mentioned loss of trees in Sub-Area 1 (i.e. proposed R(A) zone):

*“Regarding Sub-Area 1, amongst the 1255 nos. of trees recorded (including 70 nos. Trees of Particular Interest (TPIs)), 267 nos. are proposed to be retained (including 25 nos. of TPI), 954 nos. of trees are proposed to be felled (including 11 nos. of TPI) and 34 nos. of TPI are proposed to be transplanted. No rare and protected species are proposed to be felled in Sub-Area 1”*

Meanwhile, the EIA report estimated habitat loss for the proposed layout scheme in R(A) zone. Part of the turfgrass and mixed woodland can still be preserved, but all 0.39-hectare woodland would be loss.



長春社 Since 1968

The Conservancy Association

會址: 香港新界葵涌貨櫃碼頭路 77-81 號 Magnet Place 一期  
13 樓 1305-6 室

Address: Units 1305-6, 13/F, Tower 1, Magnet Place, 77-81 Container Port  
Road, Kwai Chung, New Territories, H.K.

網址 Website: www.cahk.org.hk

電話 Tel.: (852) 2728 6781 傳真 Fax.: (852) 2728 5538

電子郵件 E-mail: cahk@cahk.org.hk

**Estimated Habitat Loss for the Proposed Layout Scheme at Sub-Area 1<sup>1</sup>**

Habitat	Area size within Sub-Area 1 (ha)	Loss under the proposed layout (ha)
Developed area	1.82	1.82
Turfgrass	5.07	4.48
Mixed woodland	3.72	2.85
<b>Woodland</b>	<b>0.39</b>	<b>0.39</b>
Total	11.0	9.54

From the above it seems that tree removal and vegetation clearance in large scale would be inevitable. Although it is claimed that actual woodland loss in the proposed R(A) zone would be minimized as far as practicable during design stage, we are still very concerned if the proposed development can be further adjusted to avoid/minimize direct loss of woodland/mixed woodland.

**How to further minimize direct loss of woodland in the proposed R(A) zone**

As mentioned above, there would be 100% loss of woodland in the proposed R(A) zone. According to the preliminary layout plan and tree survey plan, the 0.39-hectare woodland was mostly encroached by a residential block and podium garden. We noted that a public transport interchange (PTI) / bus terminus was indeed proposed right next to that residential block and podium garden (Figure 1). It is doubtful if the project proponent has once considered incorporating the residential block on top of the PTI / bus terminus in the layout plan so that the woodland can be protected as much as possible.

**How to ensure green buffer in the proposed R(A) zone**

Mixed woodland can also be spotted in the eastern and western part of proposed R(A) zone along Fan Kam Road and Ping Kong Road. While new trees are proposed as buffer planting according to the conceptual landscape and mitigation plan, we

<sup>1</sup> Table 9.23 Estimated Habitat Loss for the Proposed Layout Scheme at Sub-Area 1 of the Project Site, Technical Study on Partial Development of Fanling Golf Course Site – Feasibility Study [https://www.epd.gov.hk/eia/register/report/eiareport/eia\\_2822022/Chapter%209/CE17\\_2019\\_EIA\\_C h9%20EcoIA.htm](https://www.epd.gov.hk/eia/register/report/eiareport/eia_2822022/Chapter%209/CE17_2019_EIA_C h9%20EcoIA.htm)



長春社 Since 1968

## The Conservancy Association

會址: 香港新界葵涌貨櫃碼頭路 77-81 號 Magnet Place 一期  
13 樓 1305-6 室

Address: Units 1305-6, 13/F, Tower 1, Magnet Place, 77-81 Container Port  
Road, Kwai Chung, New Territories, H.K.

網址 Website: www.cahk.org.hk

電話 Tel.: (852) 2728 6781 傳真 Fax.: (852) 2728 5538

電子郵件 E-mail: cahk@cahk.org.hk

wonder if retention of existing trees and vegetation there can still achieve the same purpose to maintain a green buffer, and also avoid extensive clearance of mixed woodland. For the trees/woodland to be retained, sufficient buffer area should be provided during construction and operation phase.

Referring back to the Explanatory Statement of the OZP, we note that the proposed R(A) zone contains detailed guidance or requirement on the residential development, but the concerns or any others measures related to tree and woodland protection has not been mentioned in the explanatory statement. Viewing that impact of layout plan on tree/woodland protection would be one of the main concerns in the previous Advisory Council on the Environment (ACE) discussion dated 19<sup>th</sup> August 2022, we suggested that some basic requirement on tree/woodland protection could be included in the Explanatory Statement for future reference.

## **2. Concerns on the proposed OU zone (Conservation cum Recreation)**

### **Putting conservation as priority in planning intention**

Sub-Area 2 to 4 would be zoned OU (Conservation cum Recreation). The EIA report mentioned that some land uses/works/management plan would be proposed there:

*“Recreational and ancillary facilities with minimal new structure/change to existing site conditions to support the recreation activity will primarily be provided in Sub-Area 2. Landscaping works including but not limited to planting and transplanting works that are compatible with existing habitats are also anticipated within the Sub-Areas 2 to 3. For Sub-Area 4, no works is anticipated in order to preserve its ecology. Subject to further investigation, the actual land use will be further confirmed and a proper management plan with management approach including establishment of conservation area will also be formulated to preserve the existing valuable habits.” (Section 2.9.1)*

*“It is anticipated that only recreational facilities and ancillary facilities will be provided, while no works is proposed in Sub-Area 4.” (Section 9.7.2.5)*

*“Hence, Sub-Area 2 to Sub-Area 4 should be conserved and a management plan will be formulated with the aims to manage the human activities*



# 長春社

Since 1968

## The Conservancy Association

會址: 香港新界葵涌貨櫃碼頭路 77-81 號 Magnet Place 一期  
13 樓 1305-6 室

Address: Units 1305-6, 13/F, Tower 1, Magnet Place, 77-81 Container Port  
Road, Kwai Chung, New Territories, H.K.

網址 Website: www.cahk.org.hk

電話 Tel.: (852) 2728 6781 傳真 Fax.: (852) 2728 5538

電子郵件 E-mail: cahk@cahk.org.hk

*conducted in Sub-Area 2 to Sub-Area 4 and conserve the ecologically sensitive habitats and species of conservation importance from disturbance.” (Section 9.8.3.6)*

*“In Sub-area 2, a 1-storey building may possibly be provided nearby the existing pumping station for Sub-areas 2 to 4 for future use. Since the proposed public housing development in Sub-area 2 is subject to confirmation ...” (Section 11.4.4)*

*“... primary intention is to conserve the existing natural landscape and ecological features, to provide space for recreational and ancillary facilities with minimal new structure/change to existing site conditions, serving the needs of the general public. No works would be carried out in Sub-area 4 (subject to further design development).” (Section 11.9.4)*

Since the above land use, works and management plan lacked details, the TPB mechanism would act as an important gate-keeping purpose to ensure proper conservation of existing habitats and species of conservation importance in Sub-Area 2 to 4.

Viewing the planning intention of the proposed OU zone, this zone is “*intended primarily to conserve existing natural landscape and ecological features. It is also intended for the provision of space for passive recreational uses which are compatible with the conservation intention and which serve the general public*”. Although we understand that the planning intention has once been refined to better reflect the priority of conservation, here we wish to refer to the planning intention of Nature Park in Long Valley (OU zone (Nature Park)) and see how exactly conservation was put in a higher priority:

*“This zone is intended primarily for the development of a nature park to protect and enhance existing wetland habitats for the benefit of the local ecology and promotion of nature conservation and education. The primary intention is to discourage new development unless it is required to support the conservation of the ecological integrity of the wetland habitats or the*



長春社 Since 1968

## The Conservancy Association

會址: 香港新界葵涌貨櫃碼頭路 77-81 號 Magnet Place 一期  
13 樓 1305-6 室

Address: Units 1305-6, 13/F, Tower 1, Magnet Place, 77-81 Container Port  
Road, Kwai Chung, New Territories, H.K.

網址 Website: www.cahk.org.hk

電話 Tel.: (852) 2728 6781 傳真 Fax.: (852) 2728 5538

電子郵件 E-mail: cahk@cahk.org.hk

*development of an essential infrastructure project with overriding public interest.”<sup>2</sup>*

By comparing planning intention of the above 2 zones, we would highlight the following issues:

- i. The OU zone (Nature Park) has not only focus protection but enhancement of existing habitat, so that the ecological value of the area would be further improved
- ii. The OU zone (Nature Park) has mentioned promotion of nature conservation and education
- iii. The OU zone (Nature Park) would not encourage development so that conservation intention would be further strengthened

The OU zone (Nature Park) has established a good example on how conservation can be put in high priority and ensure recreation opportunity at the same time. Therefore, we suggest that the above elements should also be included in the proposed OU zone (Conservation cum Recreation).

### **Putting “Golf Course” in Column 2**

The TPB meeting dated 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2022 has the following discussion:

*“Having noted that the Area with the existing golf course would be returned to the Government upon expiry of the land lease, a Member expressed concern on whether it was appropriate to put ‘Golf Course’ use under Column 1 of the “OU” zone. In response, the Chairperson said that as pointed out in the last meeting, the discussion should focus on the land uses of the OZP rather than the future management of the Area. Being an existing use that was not incompatible with the conservation intention, the golf course use should be respected. It had been a practice generally adopted in the plan-making process. On the contrary, it appeared unreasonable to exclude an existing use which was compatible with the planning intention.”<sup>3</sup>*

<sup>2</sup> Approved Kwu Tung North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/KTN/2  
[https://www2.ozp.tpb.gov.hk/plan/ozp\\_plan\\_notes/en/S\\_KTN\\_2\\_e.pdf#nameddest=OU](https://www2.ozp.tpb.gov.hk/plan/ozp_plan_notes/en/S_KTN_2_e.pdf#nameddest=OU)

<sup>3</sup> Section 12, Minutes of 1274<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Town Planning Board dated 22/6/2022



長春社 Since1968

## The Conservancy Association

會址: 香港新界葵涌貨櫃碼頭路 77-81 號 Magnet Place 一期  
13 樓 1305-6 室

Address: Units 1305-6, 13/F, Tower 1, Magnet Place, 77-81 Container Port  
Road, Kwai Chung, New Territories, H.K.

網址 Website: www.cahk.org.hk

電話 Tel.: (852) 2728 6781 傳真 Fax.: (852) 2728 5538

電子郵件 E-mail: cahk@cahk.org.hk

Regarding the suggestion to put “golf course” in Column 1, we have the following concerns and comments:

- It appears as if the use of “golf course” has already been ratified right after the expiry of the land lease.
- Golf course may contribute to nature conservation, but there should be mechanism for any project proponents to justify this through submitting additional information and studies. Putting “golf course” in Column 1 would not allow further evaluation and discussion on this.

To help identify and evaluate potential ecological impacts during construction and operation phase, we suggest that the use “golf course” should be put in Column 2.

Yours faithfully,

Ng Hei Man

Campaign Manager

The Conservancy Association



# 長春社

Since 1968

## The Conservancy Association

會址: 香港新界葵涌貨櫃碼頭路 77-81 號 Magnet Place 一期  
13 樓 1305-6 室

Address: Units 1305-6, 13/F, Tower 1, Magnet Place, 77-81 Container Port  
Road, Kwai Chung, New Territories, H.K.

網址 Website: www.cahk.org.hk

電話 Tel.: (852) 2728 6781 傳真 Fax.: (852) 2728 5538

電子郵件 E-mail: cahk@cahk.org.hk

**Figure 1** According to the preliminary layout plan and tree survey plan, the 0.39-hectare woodland (circled in dark blue) was mostly encroached by a residential block and podium garden. We noted that a public transport interchange (PTI) / bus terminus (circled in red) was indeed proposed right next to that residential block and podium garden

